

firing him from his own board, is entangled in his country's complicated politics.

But Bangladeshi President Hasina Wajed's remark that Yunus had "spent years sucking the blood of the poor" echoes similar charges being made in neighboring India against companies and banks that sought to emulate Grameen.

Last November, Andhra Pradesh, one of India's most populous states, cracked down heavily on private microfinance institutions (PMFIs), banning many of their activities and telling borrowers they did not need to repay their loans.

State authorities said they were prompted to take decisive action by a spate of suicides by borrowers who were unable to pay their debts. Roughly 80 clients were reported to have taken their own lives last year – an alarming figure, though tiny relative to the 26.7 million active borrowers from PMFIs in India.

'Usurious' loans

Andhra Pradesh officials charged that PMFIs, which had lent around 80 billion rupees (\$2bn) in the state, levy "usurious" interest rates (24-30 per cent per year) to sustain their promoters' extravagant salaries and profits. In addition, too many borrowers had taken multiple loans from different sources and were unable to repay them. Aggressive agents were marketing the loans with no heed to borrowers' capacity to repay.

It was alleged, too, that coercion was being used to exact repayment, leaving victims with no way out but to end their own lives.

One institution that received unwelcome attention was SKS Microfinance, once a poster child for the PMFIs, which

- Anonymous hacks Chinese websites
- Mitt Romney and the Mormon factor
- US group releases second 'Kony 2012' video
- Is the US student debt bubble about to burst?
- The subjectivity of slacktivism
- The spectacle of democracy in the US
- Fresh clashes in Syria ahead of UN mission
- Japan ready for North Korea missile launch
- Greg Mortenson to repay \$1m to charity
- The United States as #2

had done so well and grown so large that its initial public offering last year was oversubscribed 13-fold and raised \$350m.

The salaries paid to its top executives - as a reward, essentially, for lending successfully to the poorest of the poor - were excoriated by leaders across India's political spectrum. SKS' Chairman, Vikram Akula, reportedly made \$13m by selling some of his shares last year. Is it moral, critics asked, to profit so much from providing services that alleviate poverty?

But the counter-argument is that professionally-run private microcredit is better than no credit at all - the situation most of the poor confront. State banks are supposed to lend generously to India's rural poor, but their operations are mired in inefficiency and corruption. Loans often require bribes, and the banks' procedures are bewildering to the unlettered.

Traditional moneylenders are the only alternative, and they extort far more than 30 per cent a year - often at the point of a knife, or worse.

Profit vs charity

The problems with microcredit raise a larger question: should the poor be served by modern financial institutions that raise their funds in capital markets, or must they rely exclusively on non-profit sources of support? The late Indian management guru CK Prahalad suggested in his bestselling book The Fortune at the Bottom of the Pyramid that businesses could make healthy profits by serving the poor - and so satisfy their shareholders while promoting social development.

Selling five-rupee sachets of shampoo to poor consumers is considered clever marketing, but lending 5,000 rupees to a starving peasant at high interest rates is viewed as exploitative. Both activities, after all, are financed by investors looking for returns on their capital and motivated more by profit than compassion.

But one is clearly less socially acceptable than the other. A high salary earned by a cosmetics or soft-drink manufacturer attracts no attention; one paid to the CEO of a company that thrives on lending to the poor appears unseemly, if not immoral.

Yet PMFIs had succeeded by meeting a genuine need. Only 50 of India's roughly 1,000 microfinance institutions are private (as opposed to NGOs), but the top four PMFIs account for 80 per cent of the market. Many of them doubled their revenues in the 2009-2010 fiscal year, reaching more than 100 million borrowers, whereas rural co-operatives, which also make small loans, grew by 3 per cent, to 45 million borrowers. State banks are farther behind.

PMFIs are lending in a market vitiated by a populist political culture. Whereas microcredit institutions' business model depends on a very high repayment rate (often exceeding 98 per cent), government-run banks and state-supported co-operatives tend eventually to write off their loans when elections come around, with state and national governments waiving poor farmers' debts for political reasons. Private institutions obviously cannot afford to do that.

There are other complications. The village moneylender, though often a shark, at least belongs to the community and knows his clients. A PMFI, as a faceless institution, relies on good faith and peer pressure to recover its money.

The moneylender is happy to lend for any purpose, including non-productive expenditures like weddings and dowries, whereas a PMFI, if it is to succeed, can finance only income-generating, economically sustainable activities. But PMFIs seeking to attract private-equity capital emphasized growth over sustainability, lent indiscriminately to people who couldn't pay them back - and attracted public opprobrium in the process.

Indian regulators are sorting out the tangle of issues that have plunged India's microfinance industry into crisis. Ironically, none of these problems seems to have befallen Bangladesh's Grameen Bank, which survives largely on donor grants and sustainable repayments. Yunus's ouster, it is suggested, has much more to do with his having once expressed political ambitions. But association with a suddenly tarnished industry cannot have helped.

Shashi Tharoor, a former Indian Minister of State for External Affairs and UN Under- Secretary General, is a member of India's parliament and the author of several books, most recently Nehru: the Invention of India (in German).

This article was first published by Project Syndicate.

The views expressed in this article are the author's own and do not necessarily reflect AI Jazeera's editorial policy.

Source: Al Jazeera M Email 🗎 Print Share 1,055 people recommend this. Be the first of your Recommend friends Topics in this article People Country Mohammed Yunus India Bangladesh

Egypt's Spring



Featured on AI Jazeera

The dangers of



Comprehensive coverage of presidential campaigns from the primary season through November 6

> NOW NEWSHOUR NEXT News [In 19 mins]

Today's Schedule

More Opinion

amid Dabashi



The subjectivity of slacktivism



The spectacle of democracy in the US



Race and the paradox of America



Is Portugal hopeless?



US: Fixing democracy at home



Putin's challenge: The Circassians and the Winter Olympics

The doctrine of intervention

A year after Juliano Mer-Khamis' murder, it's time to board the freedom bus ark LeVine



The United States as #2



Send Feedback

Hans Blix: The

Organisation United Nations

Why Peter Beinart

Tweet 29

Debating the US Supreme Court's power



George Galloway: Occupy the constituencies



Uprooting 30,000 Bedouin in Israel



Austerity vs solidarity: Democratic legitimacy and Europe's future

http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2011/03/201139115351585...



reporting the 'war on terror' We look at Obama's role in the continued imprisonment of a Yemeni journalist and the issues behind it.



Muslim Brotherhood's decision to run a candidate for president, despite earlier pledges not to, worries Egyptians.



Peter Beinart's latest book has not only angered the Israeli left, but has caused fury amid the right.



The former UN weapons inspector discusses Iran's nuclear programme and how to prevent another war in the region.



Ioin Our Mailing List	
mail Address	
Subscribe	







💆 links from aljazeera.com

- International Criminal Court says it cannot investigate alleged Israeli ÷ crimes in Gaza because Palestine is not a state. 1842 points1843 points1844 points | 972 comments
- Al Jazeera English has been named as one of the recipients of the 71st Annual Peabody Awards for the channel's ground-breaking coverage of the Arab Awakening 1879 points1880 points1881 points | 307 comments
- Anonymous hacks Chinese
- government websites. A number of websites are replaced with messages on how to circumvent government restrictions on the internet. 2034 points2035 points2036 points | 418 comments
- Myanmar democracy icon and Nobel
- Peace Prize winner Aung San Suu Kyi has been elected to the country's parliament in landmark elections 547 points548 points549 points | 63 comments
- How the West de-democratised the Middle East 4
- 60 points61 points62 points | 44 comments

News

Africa Americas Asia-Pacific Central/S.Asia Europe Middle East Sport

In Depth

Opinion Features Spotlight Briefings Blogs Your Views

Programmes

The Stream Witness Inside Story Listening Post People & Power Fault Lines **Fabulous Picture Show** Frost Over The World 101 East One on One **Counting The Cost** Talk to Al Jazeera Empire The Cafe Al Jazeera World

Watch Live On Demand

Podcasts Mobile **Broadcast Schedule** Hotel/Partners

About Us

Advertise with Us Search Weather **Creative Commons** Work for us Transparency Unit Community Rules **Terms & Conditions**